Indian Journal of Social Sciences and Literature Studies
Vol. 12, Issue 2, October 2026
ISSN 2349-5634 (Print) ISSN 2455-0973 (online)

Exploring the Relationships Among Self-Criticism, Self-Compassion, and Mindfulness in Young Adults: A Scoping Review

Dr. Arefa J. Mansuri

St. Xavier's College; Department of Psychology, Gujarat University, Gujarat, India

Associate Professor; M.Phil. & Ph.D. Guide

Abstract

Young adulthood involves academic, occupational, interpersonal, and identity-related changes that can create repeated situations for self-evaluation. Persistent self-criticism may be associated with poorer psychological adjustment, whereas self-compassion provides a more supportive way of responding to personal difficulty. Mindfulness may also be relevant because it involves noticing thoughts and emotions with greater awareness and less automatic judgment. However, the available literature does not establish a consistent causal sequence in which mindfulness increases self-compassion and, in turn, reduces self-criticism. This scoping review mapped research on self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness among young adults, with attention to how these constructs have been defined, measured, and examined together. The review was reported with reference to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR). Literature published between 2009 and 2024 was identified through PubMed and Google Scholar, supplemented by reference-list screening and relevant publisher or institutional records. Studies involving young adults, university students, or college students that examined at least two of the three core constructs were considered eligible. The evidence included observational, qualitative, controlled

intervention, randomised, and dissertation research. Across studies, self-compassion was generally associated with lower self-criticism, while mindfulness- and compassion-based interventions commonly reported improvements in self-compassion or mindfulness and, in several studies, reductions in self-critical responding. Indian evidence was limited. Overall, the findings point to a consistent relationship between self-compassion and self-criticism and a frequent association between mindfulness and self-compassion, but they do not establish a single causal pathway linking all three constructs. Future research should use longitudinal and experimental designs, clearer separation of intervention components, and more diverse samples, including greater representation of Indian young adults.

Keywords: self-criticism; self-compassion; mindfulness; young adults; emerging adulthood; psychological well-being

Introduction

Young adulthood is an important developmental period characterized by changes in education, employment, relationships, independence, and identity. These changes can involve uncertainty, social comparison, perceived failure, and concerns about personal competence. Such experiences may influence how individuals evaluate themselves and respond to difficulties. Self-criticism is one process that can become prominent in this context and involves harsh self-evaluation in response to perceived mistakes or shortcomings.

Self-criticism is not necessarily harmful. Realistic self-evaluation can help people identify mistakes and make changes. The concern arises when self-evaluation becomes persistent, punitive, or strongly focused on personal inadequacy. For young adults, academic performance, career decisions, relationships, appearance, and expectations about the future can all provide situations in which self-critical thinking becomes more pronounced.

Self-compassion offers a different way of responding to personal difficulty. Neff (2003) described self-compassion in terms of self-kindness, common humanity, and mindfulness. It involves responding to failure or distress with understanding, recognising that difficulty is part of the human experience, and maintaining balanced awareness of painful thoughts and emotions. Self-compassion should therefore not be treated simply as the opposite of self-criticism; it represents a broader way of responding to oneself during difficult experiences.

Mindfulness is also relevant to these processes. It involves purposeful attention to present-moment experience with openness and reduced judgment (Kabat-Zinn, 2003). In the context of self-critical thinking, mindful awareness may help individuals notice negative thoughts without immediately accepting or reinforcing them. At the same time, mindfulness and self-compassion are not interchangeable. Mindfulness primarily concerns awareness, whereas

self-compassion also includes a supportive orientation toward oneself and recognition of common humanity (Neff, 2003).

The literature on these constructs has developed across partly separate areas. Some studies examine self-compassion and self-criticism, others focus on mindfulness and self-compassion, and several interventions combine mindfulness, compassion, meditation, or related practices. Differences in study design, measures, and intervention content make direct comparison difficult. A scoping review is therefore useful for describing the range of available evidence without assuming a causal model in advance.

The present review aimed to map research examining self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness among young adults. It examined how the constructs have been conceptualized and measured, what relationships have been reported among them, which study designs and interventions have been used, and what gaps remain. Indian evidence was considered where identified, without assuming that findings from other cultural settings necessarily generalize to Indian young adults.

Conceptual Background and Theoretical Framework

Self-Criticism

Self-criticism refers to a pattern of harsh self-evaluation, self-blame, or feelings of inadequacy in response to perceived mistakes or shortcomings. It does not necessarily operate as a stable characteristic across all situations. Zuroff et al. (2021), for example, found meaningful variation in self-criticism across different domains of the self. A person may therefore be highly self-critical in academic or appearance-related situations while responding more constructively in other areas.

Self-Compassion

Self-compassion involves responding to personal difficulty with understanding rather than excessive self-judgment. Neff's (2003) model includes self-kindness, common humanity, and mindfulness. The concept does not mean ignoring mistakes or avoiding responsibility. Rather, it reflects a less punitive response to failure and distress and may make it easier for individuals to respond to setbacks without becoming excessively self-critical.

Mindfulness

Mindfulness involves awareness of present experience with openness and reduced judgment (Kabat-Zinn, 2003). It may be relevant to self-criticism because it can help individuals notice thoughts as mental events rather than immediately treating them as facts. Mindfulness is nevertheless not synonymous with self-compassion. Self-compassion adds an explicitly supportive response toward oneself (Neff, 2003).

Relationship Among the Three Constructs

The three constructs overlap but are not identical. Self-criticism describes a harsh evaluative response to the self, self-compassion describes a more supportive response to personal difficulty, and mindfulness describes a way of attending to present experience. Existing evidence suggests that greater self-compassion is often associated with lower self-criticism, while mindfulness is frequently associated with greater self-compassion. At the same time, studies differ in whether they examine simple associations, mediation, moderation, or intervention effects. The present review therefore treats the constructs as related but distinct and does not assume that mindfulness inevitably produces self-compassion or that self-compassion eliminates self-critical thoughts.

Young Adults as the Population of Interest

Young adulthood involves major transitions and repeated opportunities for self-evaluation. University and college students may experience academic competition, career uncertainty, changing relationships, financial concerns, and identity development. These contexts make self-critical and self-compassionate responses particularly relevant and provide a practical setting for preventive and skills-based interventions.

Method

Review Design

The review used a scoping-review approach and was reported with reference to the PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR) (Tricco et al., 2018). A scoping design was selected because the literature includes varied definitions, measures, populations, and intervention approaches. The purpose was to map the breadth and characteristics of the evidence rather than calculate a pooled effect size or test a single causal model.

Review Question and Objectives

The review question was: How have self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness been examined and related among young adults? The objectives were to identify studies examining at least two of the three constructs; describe definitions, measures, samples, and designs; summarise reported relationships and intervention outcomes; identify Indian and other cultural evidence; and identify conceptual and methodological gaps.

Eligibility Criteria

Studies were considered eligible when participants were young adults or when the study clearly focused on university, college, or emerging-adult populations relevant to this developmental period. Because the included literature did not use a single age definition

consistently, studies were not restricted to an exact 18–29-year range when the target population was clearly young adults or students. Mixed-age student studies were retained when the young-adult or college population was central to the sample. Studies had to examine at least two of the three core constructs: self-criticism, self-compassion, or mindfulness. Quantitative, qualitative, mixed-method, intervention, and relevant dissertation research were eligible. Studies focusing only on children or adolescents, older adults without a relevant young-adult or student component, or papers examining none of the core constructs were excluded. Conceptual papers were used for background and were not counted as empirical included studies.

Information Sources and Search Strategy

The search was structured around the three conceptual domains of self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness, combined with terms related to young adults, emerging adults, college students, and university students. PubMed and Google Scholar were searched, with additional screening of reference lists and relevant publisher or institutional records. Example search terms included “self-criticism,” “self-compassion,” “mindfulness,” “young adults,” “emerging adults,” “college students,” and “university students.” Pairwise searches were also used because many studies examined two constructs rather than all three together. The search covered literature published between 2009 and 2024.

For this research, the available search documentation did not retain complete database-specific search dates, full Boolean strings, or the numerical record counts needed for a fully reproducible PRISMA-ScR flow. These details should be checked against the original search history before the manuscript is submitted for publication. No numerical screening figures have been added where the underlying records could not be verified.

Study Selection and Data Charting

Potentially relevant records were screened against the population and construct criteria. Background papers were separated from empirical studies so that theoretical sources were not presented as included research. Data charted from eligible studies included author and year, setting, sample characteristics, age where reported, design, constructs assessed, measures or intervention details, and principal findings.

Methodological Quality Considerations

Formal risk-of-bias grading was not used as an exclusion criterion because the purpose of the review was evidence mapping. Study limitations were nevertheless considered when interpreting the findings. These included small samples, cross-sectional designs, reliance on self-report measures, absence of control groups in some studies, and short follow-up periods.

Data Synthesis

Findings were synthesised narratively in four areas: self-compassion and self-criticism; mindfulness and self-compassion; mindfulness and self-criticism; and studies examining all three constructs or combining mindfulness and compassion practices. Cultural and methodological patterns were also considered.

Ethical Considerations

The review used published or publicly available secondary literature and did not involve the collection of primary participant data. Institutional ethical approval was therefore not sought for the review.

Results

Characteristics of the Mapped Evidence

Twelve empirical studies met the working eligibility criteria represented in the present draft. The evidence included observational, qualitative, controlled intervention, randomised, and

dissertation research. Most samples consisted of university or college students, although some studies focused on young adults from community or specific-risk groups. The studies were conducted across several countries, including India, the United States, Norway, Slovakia, South Korea, Iran, and Colombia. Mindfulness and self-compassion were frequently examined together, whereas studies addressing all three constructs within the same design were less common.

Table 1

Characteristics of Empirical Studies Relevant to the Review

Study	Location	Sample	Design	Core constructs	Measure/Intervention	Principal finding
Harshitha & Sasi (2019)	India	300 emerging adults, 18–25 years	Ex post facto	Self-compassion; self-criticism	Self-Compassion Scale; Forms of Self-Criticising/Attacking & Self-Reassuring Scale	Self-compassion was significantly negatively related to self-criticism.
Greeson et al. (2014)	USA	90 students; M = 25.4 years; range 18–59	Randomized controlled trial	Mindfulness; self-compassion	Koru mindfulness programme	Mindfulness and self-compassion improved relative to the wait-list condition.
Toole & Craighead (2016)	USA	80 undergraduate women, 18–21 years, with body-image concerns	Randomized controlled trial	Self-compassion; self-criticism	One-week self-compassion meditation	The intervention improved aspects of self-compassion and reduced the self-criticism factor; aspects of body-image distress also improved, while adherence to home practice was low.
Patel et al. (2018)	India	72 college students, 18–25 years	Pre-post intervention	Mindfulness; self-compassion	Mastering Emotions Technique (45 min/day for 2 weeks)	Self-compassion and mindfulness improved alongside emotional-regulation outcomes.
Halamová et al. (2018)	Slovakia	146 nonclinical participants	Online intervention with pre-, post-, and 2-month follow-up	Self-criticism; self-compassion; self-reassurance	Short-term online mindfulness-based intervention using MBSR exercises for 15 consecutive days	Self-criticism and uncompassionate responding decreased and these effects remained at 2-month follow-up. Self-compassion improved in the short term but the effect was not maintained at follow-up.
Joss et al. (2019)	USA	38 young adults, 22–29 years; 20 intervention and 18 wait-list	Controlled pilot study	Mindfulness; self-compassion	Mindfulness-based behavioural intervention	Mindfulness and self-compassion increased, with reductions in stress and anxiety; changes in mindfulness and self-compassion were positively correlated.
Binder et al. (2019)	Norway	97 intervention completers; 94 survey respondents; 12 interviewed	Qualitative intervention study	Self-compassion; self-criticism; mindfulness practice	Three-session self-compassion course	Participants described greater awareness of self-criticism, greater self-support, greater acceptance of difficult feelings, and greater emotional stability.
Noh & Cho (2020)	South Korea	38 university students with high self-criticism; 18 intervention and 20 wait-list	Controlled intervention	Mindfulness; self-criticism; compassion	Mindful Lovingkindness Compassion Program	Self-criticism and psychological distress decreased, while self-reassurance and other positive outcomes increased; self-report improvements were maintained at 1- and 3-month follow-up.
Zuroff et al. (2021)	Canada/ USA	Four young-adult samples	Multi-study observational	Self-criticism; self-compassion;	Domain-specific assessment across eight domains	Self-criticism and self-compassion varied across domains, showing that these processes are not

				self-reassurance		expressed in exactly the same way across situations.
Sajjadi et al. (2023)	Iran	47 young adults, 18–25 years, with childhood maltreatment history	Controlled semiexperimental intervention	Mindful self-compassion; self-criticism	Eight-session Mindful Self-Compassion programme	The intervention was associated with reductions in self-criticism and psychological difficulties.
Newby (2014)	USA	48 participants in analysed intervention and control groups	Controlled dissertation study	Mindfulness; self-compassion; self-criticism	Yoga with meditation over approximately two months	The intervention group showed decreased self-criticism and increased self-compassion and mindfulness relative to controls.
Torres Lancheros et al. (2023)	Colombia	35 university students	Randomized pretest-posttest with wait-list control	Mindfulness; self-compassion; self-criticism	Four-session online modified Mindful Self-Compassion programme	Self-compassion and mindfulness increased, while self-criticism and several emotional symptoms decreased.

Thematic Synthesis

Self-Compassion and Self-Criticism. Across the reviewed studies, the most consistent finding was the negative relationship between self-compassion and self-criticism. Harshitha and Sasi (2019), using 300 Indian emerging adults aged 18–25 years, reported a significant negative relationship between the two constructs. Halamová et al. (2018) found reductions in self-criticism following a short online mindfulness-based intervention, while Noh and Cho (2020) reported reductions in self-criticism following a programme that combined mindfulness, lovingkindness, and compassion. These findings point to a possible link between a more supportive response to personal difficulty and lower self-critical responding, but they do not show that self-compassion eliminates self-critical thinking.

Mindfulness and Self-Compassion. Several intervention studies reported changes in mindfulness and self-compassion in the same direction. Greeson et al. (2014) found improvements in both outcomes following Koru among college and emerging-adult students. Joss et al. (2019) reported increases in mindfulness and self-compassion after a mindfulness-based intervention among young adults, and changes in the two constructs were positively related. Patel et al. (2018) also reported improvements in mindfulness and self-compassion after a two-week yoga-based meditation programme among college students in India. Because several

of these interventions contained more than one active component, the findings do not isolate the effect of mindfulness alone.

Mindfulness and Self-Criticism. Direct evidence linking mindfulness with self-criticism was less common. Halamová et al. (2018) found reductions in self-criticism after a short online mindfulness-based intervention, with the effect remaining at two-month follow-up. Noh and Cho (2020) also found reduced self-criticism following a programme that combined mindfulness with lovingkindness and compassion. These findings are relevant but should be interpreted in light of the combined intervention content and differences in study design.

Studies Examining the Three Constructs Together. Newby (2014) reported decreased self-criticism and increased self-compassion and mindfulness following yoga with meditation among graduate students. Torres Lancheros et al. (2023) similarly reported improvements in self-compassion and mindfulness together with reductions in self-criticism and related emotional symptoms after a brief group intervention. Binder et al. (2019) provided qualitative evidence that students became more aware of self-critical patterns and described greater self-support after a brief self-compassion course that included mindfulness practice. These studies show that the three constructs can change together, but they do not establish a common direction of influence.

Indian Evidence. Indian evidence was limited. Harshitha and Sasi (2019) directly examined self-compassion and self-criticism among emerging adults, while Patel et al. (2018) examined mindfulness and self-compassion among college students. Both studies support the relevance of these constructs in Indian young-adult samples, but the small number of studies is not sufficient to support broad cultural conclusions.

Methodological Patterns. Cross-sectional and self-report approaches were common, while intervention studies varied in duration, content, control conditions, and outcome measures.

Several studies used relatively small samples, and follow-up periods were often short or absent. The evidence also varied in whether mindfulness, self-compassion, and self-criticism were assessed as separate constructs or within multi-component interventions. These differences make direct comparison difficult and limit conclusions about long-term effects and causal direction.

Discussion

The reviewed literature points to consistent relationships among self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness, but it does not support a single causal explanation. The strongest pattern concerns self-compassion and self-criticism: higher self-compassion tends to be associated with lower self-criticism, and several interventions that cultivate compassion report reductions in self-critical responding. Mindfulness is often related to self-compassion, but the evidence is less clear about whether mindfulness itself is responsible for changes in self-criticism.

The relationship between self-compassion and self-criticism is supported by both observational and intervention research. Harshitha and Sasi (2019) found lower self-criticism among Indian emerging adults with greater self-compassion. Halamová et al. (2018), Noh and Cho (2020), and other intervention studies also reported reductions in self-critical responding. At the same time, self-criticism should not be treated as uniformly maladaptive. Some degree of self-evaluation can help people recognise mistakes and change their behaviour; the concern is the more punitive and global form of self-attack.

The mindfulness findings require more caution. Greeson et al. (2014), Joss et al. (2019), and Patel et al. (2018) reported improvements in mindfulness and self-compassion together. Joss et al. (2019) also found a positive relationship between changes in mindfulness and self-compassion. However, several interventions combined mindfulness with compassion,

meditation, yoga, or other practices. As a result, the available evidence does not justify the claim that mindfulness alone causes greater self-compassion or reduced self-criticism.

The distinction between mindfulness and self-compassion is also important for interpreting these findings. Mindfulness concerns awareness and balanced attention, whereas self-compassion includes a supportive response toward oneself (Neff, 2003). Treating the two constructs as interchangeable can make it difficult to identify which part of an intervention is associated with change. This issue is especially relevant in programmes that combine mindfulness and compassion exercises within the same treatment.

For young adults, these findings are relevant because academic demands, career decisions, relationships, appearance concerns, and social comparison can create repeated situations for self-evaluation. Mindfulness and self-compassion practices may provide useful psychological skills for responding to these experiences. The current evidence, however, supports these approaches as promising rather than as established solutions for self-criticism.

The Indian findings should be interpreted cautiously. The available studies show that mindfulness and self-compassion have been examined in Indian college and emerging-adult populations, but the evidence base remains small. More research across regions, educational settings, socioeconomic backgrounds, and different young-adult groups is needed before conclusions about cultural differences or Indian-specific mechanisms can be drawn.

A strength of the review is that it brings together literatures that are often examined separately. The main limitation is the heterogeneity of the available evidence and the incomplete search documentation available for this draft. In particular, database-specific search dates, complete search strings, and numerical screening records were not retained in the materials used to prepare the current manuscript. This limits the reproducibility of the search process and means

that the final PRISMA-ScR flow should be completed from the original search history before formal submission.

Research Gaps and Future Directions

Future research should use longitudinal designs to examine whether changes in mindfulness are followed by changes in self-compassion and self-criticism, or whether the relationships operate in both directions. Experimental studies should distinguish mindfulness-only components from compassion-focused components when both are delivered together. Larger and more diverse samples are also needed rather than relying heavily on university students. Indian research should examine cultural and contextual factors directly and include participants from different regions, educational backgrounds, and social settings. Repeated-measure, diary, behavioural, and mixed-method approaches may provide a clearer picture of how self-critical and self-compassionate responses change in everyday situations.

Practical Implications

The reviewed evidence suggests that mindfulness- and self-compassion-based programmes may be useful in university and young-adult settings, particularly for individuals who experience persistent self-criticism. Possible components include noticing self-critical thoughts, practising present-moment awareness, developing a more compassionate response to mistakes, and reducing habitual self-attack. These approaches should be presented as psychological skills that may support adjustment rather than as guaranteed methods for eliminating self-criticism.

Conclusion

The literature reviewed in this scoping review shows a fairly consistent relationship between self-compassion and lower self-criticism, while mindfulness is frequently associated

with greater self-compassion. Several intervention studies also report improvements in these areas when mindfulness and compassion practices are combined. However, the evidence is not sufficient to conclude that mindfulness alone leads to greater self-compassion and, in turn, lower self-criticism. The field would benefit from stronger longitudinal and experimental research, clearer measurement of the three constructs, better separation of intervention components, and greater representation of Indian young adults.

References

Binder, P.-E., Dundas, I., Stige, S. H., Hjeltnes, A., Woodfin, V., & Moltu, C. (2019). Becoming aware of inner self-critique and kinder toward self: A qualitative study of experiences of outcome after a brief self-compassion intervention for university level students. *Frontiers in Psychology, 10*, 2728. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02728

Greeson, J. M., Juberg, M. K., Maytan, M., James, K., & Rogers, H. (2014). A randomized controlled trial of Koru: A mindfulness program for college students and other emerging adults. *Journal of American College Health, 62*(4), 222–233. https://doi.org/10.1080/07448481.2014.887571

Halamová, J., Kanovský, M., Jurková, V., & Kupeli, N. (2018). Effect of a short-term online version of a mindfulness-based intervention on self-criticism and self-compassion in a nonclinical sample. *Studia Psychologica, 60*(4), 259–273. https://doi.org/10.21909/sp.2018.04.766

Harshitha, S., & Sasi, R. (2019). Self-compassion, self-criticism and hope among emerging adults. *International Journal of Indian Psychology, 7*(2), 30–37. https://doi.org/10.25215/0702.005

Joss, D., Khan, A., Lazar, S. W., & Teicher, M. H. (2019). Effects of a mindfulness-based intervention on self-compassion and psychological health among young adults with a history of childhood maltreatment. *Frontiers in Psychology, 10*, 2373. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02373

Kabat-Zinn, J. (2003). Mindfulness-based interventions in context: Past, present, and future. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice, 10*(2), 144–156. https://doi.org/10.1093/clipsy.bpg016

Neff, K. D. (2003). Self-compassion: An alternative conceptualization of a healthy attitude toward oneself. *Self and Identity, 2*(2), 85–101. https://doi.org/10.1080/15298860309032

Newby, K. (2014). *The effects of yoga with meditation (YWM) on self-criticism, self-compassion, and mindfulness* [Doctoral dissertation, Philadelphia College of Osteopathic Medicine]. PCOM Psychology Dissertations. https://digitalcommons.pcom.edu/psychology_dissertations/296

Noh, S., & Cho, H. (2020). Psychological and physiological effects of the Mindful Lovingkindness Compassion Program on highly self-critical university students in South Korea. *Frontiers in Psychology, 11*, 585743. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.585743

Patel, N. K., Nivethitha, L., & Mooventhan, A. (2018). Effect of a yoga based meditation technique on emotional regulation, self-compassion and mindfulness in college students. *Explore, 14*(6), 443–447. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2018.06.008

Sajjadi, M., Noferesti, A., & Abbasi, M. (2023). Mindful self-compassion intervention among young adults with a history of childhood maltreatment: Reducing psychopathological

symptoms, shame, and self-criticism. *Current Psychology, 42*(30), 26227–26237. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-022-03761-0

Toole, A. M., & Craighead, L. W. (2016). Brief self-compassion meditation training for body image distress in young adult women. *Body Image, 19*, 104–112. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bodyim.2016.09.001

Torres Lancheros, J. E., Vargas Nieto, J. C., & Arcila Ibarra, S. (2023). Mindfulness and self-compassion decrease emotional symptoms, self-criticism, rumination and worry in college students: A preliminary study of the effects of group self-compassion-based interventions. *Journal of Evidence-Based Psychotherapies, 23*(2), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.24193/jebp.2023.2.8

Tricco, A. C., Lillie, E., Zarin, W., O'Brien, K. K., Colquhoun, H., Levac, D., Moher, D., Peters, M. D. J., Horsley, T., Weeks, L., Hempel, S., Akl, E. A., Chang, C., McGowan, J., Stewart, L., Hartling, L., Aldcroft, A., Wilson, M. G., Garritty, C., & Straus, S. E. (2018). PRISMA extension for scoping reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and explanation. *Annals of Internal Medicine, 169*(7), 467–473. https://doi.org/10.7326/M18-0850

Zuroff, D. C., Clegg, K.-A., Levine, S. L., Hermanto, N., Armstrong, B. F., Haward, B., & Thode, S. (2021). Beyond trait models of self-criticism and self-compassion: Variability over domains and the search for signatures. *Personality and Individual Differences, 170*, 110429. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2020.110429